The Effectiveness of the Transportation Agency's Role in Monitoring Illegal Travel

Alif Ihwan Hamonangan¹, Khotami², Ranggi Ade Febrian³,

Universitas Islam Riau 1-3,

Email Korespondensi: Alifihwanhamonangan717@student.uir.ac.id1,khotami@edu.uir.ac.id2,

Article received: 01 Juli 2024, Review process: 26 Juli 2024, Article Accepted: 05 Agustus 2024, Article published: 23 Agustus 2024

ABSTRACT

This research aims to find out how effective the role of the Rokan Hulu district transportation service is in monitoring illegal travel in the city of Pasir Pengaraian. This study used descriptive qualitative method. The indicators in this research are input, process, output and outcome. This research was conducted at the Rokan Hulu Regency transportation service. Collecting data obtained through interviews, observation, documentation. The author's technique for determining informants uses the snowball sampling method. The snowball sampling method is a technique for taking data sources, initially the number is small and then becomes larger, this is because the few data sources are not able to provide satisfactory data, so look for other informants to use as data sources. Based on the research results, it can be concluded that the effectiveness of the role of the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Service in monitoring illegal travel in Pasir Pengaraian City is still not effective and optimal because what happens in the field in the monitoring process is only monitoring actions in routine operations and raids, but these activities are still rare. done. The inhibiting factors or obstacles for the Rokan Hulu district transportation service are that they are still careless in terms of supervision, lack of certainty and schedule in carrying out supervision, limited budget, lack of level of public awareness, and still difficulty for transport drivers in processing permits.

Keywords: Effectiveness, Supervision, Illegal travel transportation

ABSTRAK

Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk mengetahui bagaimana Efektivitas peran dinas perhubungan kabupaten rokan hulu dalam mengawasi travel ilegal di kota pasir pengaraian. Penelitian ini menggunakan metode deskriptif kualitatif. Adapun indikator dalam penelitian ini yaitu input, proses, output dan outcome, Penelitian ini dilakukan di dinas perhubungan Kabupaten Rokan Hulu. Pengumpulan data yang di peroleh melalui wawancara, observasi, dokumentasi. Teknik penentuan informan penulis menggunakan metode snowball sampling. Metode snowball sampling ialah teknik pengambilan sumber data pada awalnya jumlah nya sedikit kemudian menjadi membesar, hal ini dikarnakan sumber data yang sedikit belum mampu memberikan data yang memuaskan, maka mencari informan lain yang digunakan sebagai sumber data. Berdasarkan hasil penelitian dapat di simpulkan bahwa Efektivitas peran dinas perhubungan kabupaten rokan hulu dalam mengawasi Travel Ilegal di Kota Pasir Pengaraian masih belum efektif dan optimal karena yang terjadi di lapangan dalam proses pengawasan yang dilakukan hanya tindakan

pengawasan dalam operasi dan razia rutin namun kegiatan tersebut masih jarang dilakukan. Adapun faktor faktor penghambat ataupun kendala dinas perhubungan kabupaten rokan hulu yaitu masih lengahnya dalam hal pengawasan,Kurang nya kepastian dan jadwal dalam melakukan pengawasan,terbatasnya anggaran, kurangnya tingkat kesadaran masyarakat, dan masih sulitnya supir angkutan dalam mengurus perizinan

Kata Kunci: Efektivitas, Pengawasan, Angkutan travel illegal.

INTRODUCTION

The highway is designed as a means of facilitating transport for transportation that provides a safe, fast, orderly, comfortable, effective, and affordable experience for the people who pass through it. It has the ability to collaborate with additional transportation models and spread throughout the land area to support the country's equity, progress, and advancement. One way to measure a country's progress is to see how well its citizens' legal awareness is. The higher the legal awareness of its citizens, the more orderly the life of the society and the country will be (Astutie, 2018).

Transportation is a human need to meet individual and group needs, which results in an increasing amount of transportation in every city, especially land transportation. To ensure the safe movement of people and goods, the transportation system must be regulated and constantly updated. As a result, transportation providers such as shuttle transportation must be able to properly control the community's need for transportation to transport from one person to another with one place to another. Pasir Pengaraian City is the capital and center of government and economy of Rokan Hulu Regency. In addition, it is also one of the villages in Rokan Hulu Regency, Riau Province, Indonesia. It is also often referred to by the nickname "Negeri Seribu Suluk", a term that refers to the discipline demonstrated by the application of Islamic law. In 2020, there were 718,321 people living in Rokan Hulu Regency. Most of the indigenous population of Rokan Hulu Regency are Malays, who are related to Minang Kabau or allied with Minang, which has an impact on the increased need for transportation. Road transportation and traffic, which because it is one of the parts of regional transportation that can be developed with a capacity that has a function to provide safe, secure, orderly, and smooth travel as well as to improve the economy and progress of the region in Pasir Pengaraian City.

According to Law No. 22/2009, article 1, traffic is a designed process consisting of roads and facilities provided by the state to facilitate the movement of people, vehicles, and goods. Road traffic space on the other hand, consists of roads and supporting facilities intended to facilitate the movement of people, cars, or goods (Raharjo, 2014). Traffic is all things related to public roads as the main way to achieve goals. Traffic can be interpreted as an interaction of people, then using no means of propulsion, to a destination location to another location by passing through a road for its space as a city infrastructure support that can be used for people to help their daily work both in the city and outside the city. For now, many privately owned vehicles are in operation, causing many illegal trips,

especially in Pasir Pengaraian City, which violate traffic rules. These illegal travel routes can take over the existing official travel routes. If events like this are left unchecked, the least desirable will eventually happen as well. For example, the condition of service businesses in Pasir Pengaraian City will gradually become unprofitable. These illegal travel businesses should be firmly reprimanded by the government and related agencies.

Basically, in order for a vehicle to be considered as public transport (transportation) it must meet the requirements of Law No. 22/2009 on Road Traffic and Transport if it meets the requirements it will be given a yellow plate with black lettering to be considered official public transport. Passengers must also be given an official ticket that has life insurance for them. Travel is often chosen for traveling as it offers an easy shuttle. Despite this, a large number of trips in Pasir Pengaraian City violate Law No. 22 Year 2009. According to Gemilar 2019, the Minister of Transportation's regulation No. PM 108/2017 on the Implementation of Transportation of Persons by Public Motor Vehicles not on a Route serves special purposes as mentioned in: (a) Inter-city transportation, (b) Transportation for settlers, (c) Transportation between employees, (d) Cargo transportation, and, (e) Rental transportation.

Illegal travel has been a big concern this year. In addition, Dishub works to discipline and supervise all public transportation vehicles for route permits and KIR, as well as to ensure that the roads in Pasir Pengaraian City. Traffic supervision in Pasir Pengaraian City is carried out to ensure when traveling is safe and smooth and to reduce the crime rate. It also aims to improve the safety of public transportation by providing legal protection to passengers. Surveillance is necessary for the community because it can be awake for us to identify problems that occur in the community, such as cases of theft, and a mismatch in the prescribed state laws and regulations and make improvements to overcome the mismatch in the future.

As for the Rokan Hulu Regent Regulation Number 74 of 2019, the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Agency has the following responsibilities such as position, organizational structure, duties and functions and work procedures, namely: (1) Under regional authority, the Transportation Agency carries out government duties, (2) The Transportation Agency, mentioned in paragraph (1) is managed by a Head of Service and supervised by the Regent by the Regional Secretariat, (3) The transportation agency, mentioned in article (2) is given the responsibility to assist the Regent in carrying out government responsibilities and assistance given to the region.

The Department of Transportation of Rokan Hulu Regency because it was established and formed directly by the district level government, is included in the area of responsibility of the local government. The regent at the district level is directly responsible for the agency. The following are the main tasks and functions of the transportation and land safety section of the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Office related to supervision: (1) Carry out a job, task, activity, and research and evaluation related to the general plan of land transportation, (2)

Develop policy standards related to land transportation, (3) Train, supervise, and manage traffic on the highway both on rivers, lakes, and crossings, (4) Plan and recommend development activities in the Land Transportation Sector, (5) Carry out additional tasks assigned by the Head of the Transportation Office.

Service products by the transportation office are: 1) AJDP transportation permit, (2) AKDP transportation permit, (3) Employee transportation permit, (4) Mode Combination transportation permit, (5) Special Rental transportation permit. The requirements set by the transportation office for passenger transportation entrepreneurs who want to take care of the operation / route permit for the Passenger Transport Operation Permit are as follows. Requirements: (1) Application Deed (2) Company Deed, (3) Copy of the Deed of the Ministry of Law and Human Rights of the Company, (4) NIB (Business Identification Number), (5) Director's KTP, (6) NPWP of the Chairman, (7) Letter of Requirement to Comply with the Law, (8) No. 22 Year 2009 concerning LLAJ.

This is in accordance with the Law on Road Traffic and Transportation Number 22 of 2009 because the Indonesian government has given regulations and authority to motor vehicle brand holder associations to produce cars, especially two-wheeled and four-wheeled cars (Puspa et al., 2009). Based on the explanation above, it shows that many travels operating in Pasir Pengaraian violate the law on road traffic and transportation Number 22 of 2009 (Astutie, 2018).

The impacts that arise and the losses that occur due to the rampant illegal travel in Pasir Pengaraian City include: 1 For the region and the transportation department: (a) Lack of regional income. (b) Vehicles are not tested, driver competence is not guaranteed. (c) Illegal travel destroys the ecosystem of official and or licensed transportation. 2 For the community: (a) Does not provide safety assurance for passengers. (b) In terms of comfort, it is definitely different between official and illegal travel, for example, the condition of the transportation is not excellent and not roadworthy so it is dangerous for long trips. (c) If an accident occurs, it is not covered by insurance. (d) High fares or fees and the possibility of unilateral price increases when on the road because illegal travel does not give its passengers tickets. (e) Passengers are dropped off not according to destination or in the middle of the road. There is a risk of unwanted crimes.

Researchers found several problems in this study based on the researcher's explanation and pre-survey data in the field: (a) The data that the researcher collected in the field shows that the supervision carried out by the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Agency is still not effective in preventing illegal travel. Every day, at least 50 illegal vehicles of various brands operate through Pasir Pengaraian City. (b) The rise of illegal travel vehicles entering city roads and in several places in the interior of Pasir Pengaraian City in picking up passengers, but passengers have not realized that this illegal travel does not have life insurance in every departure, and is very dangerous and detrimental to passengers who use illegal travel. This is indicated by the large number of private trips that operate freely or illegally on the Pasir Pengaraian City Highway which attracts researchers to conduct this research entitled "The Effectiveness of the Role

of the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Office in Supervising Illegal Travel in Pasir Pengaraian City".

The research objectives must be conveyed clearly and concisely so that the research can be carried out easily. The following are the objectives of the research, namely: 1. To be able to find out how effective the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Agency is in supervising illegal travel (travel illegal) in Pasir Pengaraian City. 2. To be able to determine the identification of what factors hinder the efforts of the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Agency in supervising illegal travel (travel illegal) in Pasir Pengaraian City.

METHOD

This research uses a qualitative approach with a descriptive survey method because researchers want to analyze and interpret the results of a process, such as interviews, with the aim of revealing the meaning behind a phenomenon of a deeper research problem on a research object, where this research was conducted in the city of Pasir Pengaraian and at the transportation office of Rokan Hulu Regency. This location was chosen because it is the main task and function of the transportation office in supervising travel that does not have a route letter (illegal) in Pasir Pengaraian City, and the author found many phenomena and that the transportation office has not been optimal in supervising the transportation of people in Pasir Pengaraian City where there are private cars that are used as public transportation that operate every day, not according to what is determined and the lack of raids held so that transportation just operates every day. The key informant in this study is the head of the road transportation sector of the rokan hulu district transportation office and the informants are travel drivers and travel passengers. the data sources to be used are primary data and secondary data. The data collection techniques used are interviews, observation, and documentation. The data collected is analyzed through three stages, namely data reduction, data presentation, and conclusion drawing, with the aim of knowing how the role of the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Office is effective in monitoring illegal travel in the city of Pasir Pengaraian.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The results in this study relating to the effectiveness of the role of the transportation department in overseeing illegal travel, researchers present as follows:

1. Research Results The Effectiveness of the Role of the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Office in Supervising Illegal Travel in Pasir Pengaraian City

In this case the researcher will explain the analysis of answers based on information obtained from observations, interviews, and documentation that has been collected. The interviews conducted have been obtained from several informants including the Head of the Transportation of People and Goods

Division of the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Office, and 2 (two) travel drivers, 2 (two) travel passengers.

Effectiveness according to Mahmudi (in, Yuanggraini, 2015) effectiveness is the relationship between output and goals, meaning that the more effective the organization of the program or activity if the output contributes more to the achievement of goals. The results of a program or activity are considered effective if they meet the desired objectives or are cost-effective. The effectiveness indicators used in the following interviews that have been compiled in the previous chapter are: (1) Input (2) Process (3) Outputs (results) (3) Outcome (impact).

To make it easier to understand, the four indicators above will be discussed one by one, starting with each response given by informants to the researcher's considerations presented.

a. Input

According to Mahmudi (2015: 98) input indicators include the budget for supervision activities, socialization or counseling, and the basis of something that will be implemented or realized in accordance with plans that affect results.

1) Socialization or Counseling

Socialization and counseling is a form of an activity carried out by the rokan hulu district transportation office in supervising illegal travel in the city of pasir pengaraian so that we can find out the effectiveness of the role of the rokan hulu district transportation office in supervising illegal travel in the city of pasir pengaraian.

Based on the author's interview with Mr. Sandi Brahmadita Nst, SE, M.Ip as the Head of the Transportation Division of the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Office related to the socialization or counseling sub-indicator said:

Yes, of course there is, the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Office has several education and socialization programs designed to increase driver awareness of completing letters and operating permits and for the community, namely passengers, about the dangers of using illegal travel and the importance of using official transportation services. Among them are through community activities, namely meetings with the community, holding meetings with local communities, such as RT / RW, PKK mothers' groups, and youth organizations, to provide direct explanations about the dangers of illegal travel. And conducting direct field surveys with road checks, this is not only to crack down on illegal travel but also to spread information to road users about the dangers of using illegal travel. Through these programs, the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Office seeks to increase public awareness of the importance of choosing official and legal transportation services, and reduce the use of illegal travel that poses a risk to passenger safety. (Head of Transportation Division, Thursday, June 20, 2024).

Based on the results of interviews with Mr. Sandi Brahmadita Nst, SE, M.Ip regarding the socialization or counseling sub-indicators above, it shows that the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Office has conducted counseling and socialization to transportation drivers and the public, namely transportation

passengers, socialization carried out by means of direct delivery, either through associations, or direct socialization when supervision is carried out.

Furthermore, researchers also interviewed other informants, namely transportation or travel drivers, based on the author's interview with Mr. Zeldevia Arizona as a travel driver. Regarding the sub-indicator of socialization or counseling he said:

Yes, there is...As a travel driver in this region, I have had varied experiences in interacting with Transportation Department officers. I really appreciate the presence of Transportation Department officers in conducting socialization and raid operations on a scheduled basis. Their presence provides a sense of security and demonstrates a commitment to maintaining order in the transportation sector. I believe that closer collaboration between the Transportation Agency and local communities, including travel drivers, can improve the effectiveness of monitoring illegal travel. (Travel Driver, Saturday, June 22, 2024)

Based on the author's interview with another driver, namely Mr. Firman Putra Tama, regarding the sub-indicator of socialization or counseling, he said:

From my experience as a travel driver, I see that the socialization efforts made by the Transportation Agency are quite visible. In this case I note that the Transportation Agency is also actively patrolling and taking action against detected illegal travel. (Travel Driver, Saturday, June 22, 2024).

Researchers also conducted interviews with Mr. Ilham as a passenger. Regarding the sub-indicator of socialization or counseling, he said:

Yes, there is but in my view, information or socialization regarding legal travel in Pasir Pengaraian City needs to be improved to make it clearer for the public. Although many of us have an understanding of the difference between legal and illegal transportation services, sometimes more specific or detailed information can help people make better choices. (Passenger Travel, Sunday, June 23, 2024).

Furthermore, the author also conducted an interview with another passenger, Mrs. Rahmah Safitri. Regarding the sub-indicator of socialization or counseling, she said:

As long as I rode the pekanbaru-pasir pengaraian travel route and vice versa, I never found the transportation department or police officers conducting supervision, raids or socialization, because I boarded the travel at night. (Travel Passenger, Sunday, June 23, 2024).

Based on the results of interviews with travel drivers or transport drivers above regarding the sub-indicators of socialization and counseling carried out by the Rokan Hulu district transportation office, the statement from the travel driver said that the Rokan Hulu district transportation office had conducted socialization and counseling to travel drivers, namely providing appeals regarding passenger transportation regulations, and travel drivers also said that not only socialization

efforts were carried out by the Rokan Hulu District Transportation Office and the police but also actively patrolling and taking action against detected illegal travel.

Meanwhile, judging from the results of interviews when researchers interviewed the community, namely the transportation passengers above, it was found that the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Office had conducted socialization and counseling but the socialization carried out was not specific and detailed regarding illegal travel information in Pasir Pengaraian City, and other passengers said the transportation office had never conducted counseling or socialization as well as supervision and raids because the passenger boarded the travel at night.

Based on the results of interviews, observations, and documentation on the input indicators of the socialization and counseling sub-indicators, it can be said that the transportation agency has conducted socialization and counseling to drivers and passengers regarding the rules regarding the regulation of people's transportation, socialization with drivers, namely by appealing to obey the regulations on the transportation of people, namely by taking care of and completing all administrative documents and operating permits, and appealing to the public, namely to be able to ride travel or transportation that has a permit, because it is very dangerous when continuing to ride illegal travel, especially in Pasir Pengaraian City.

2) Budget for supervision activities

The existence of a budget in supervisory activities is one of the factors that determine whether an operation is successful or not, in accordance with Rokan Hulu Regent Regulation Number 72 of 2021, the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Office is positioned, organized, has duties and functions, and work procedures in article 17 point 1 which reads "Planning programs / activities and budgeting in the transportation section of people and goods".

Based on interviews conducted by researchers with Mr. Sandi Brahmadita Nst, SE, M.Ip as Head of the Transportation Division of the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Agency related to the budget sub-indicator for supervision activities said:

In carrying out supervisory activities, there is indeed a fund or budget for these activities, but the budget is very minimal because the scope of the Rokan Hulu district transportation office is not only in Pasir Pengaraian City but also several places in Rokan Hulu, this is also one of our inhibiting factors, but in Pasir Pengaraian City we often carry out supervision at several points, namely Kec. Rambah, we conducted raids in the Kumu area (in front of Haji Alung restaurant) and on the ring road, Rokan Hilir sub-district in the Badul Kumu intersection area, Ujung Batu sub-district, namely the Ujung Batu terminal area, Tandun sub-district, namely the PIR intersection and TB intersection area, Kabun sub-district, namely the PT Padasa and Giti Village intersection area, North Tambusai sub-district, namely the Mahato KM. 0, KM. 24 Mahato, in front of Tambusai Utara Terminal, and Bangun Jaya, Kec. Kepenuhan, in front of PT PISA and Kasimang Village, Kec. Bonai Darusalam, in Rawa Makmur Village and Duri Border Ravine,

and Kec. Kunto Darusalam, on the Kunto Darusalam Ring Road and in front of PLT Sei Intan. (Head of Transportation Division, Thursday, June 20, 2024).

Based on the results of the interview with Mr. Sandi Brahmadita Nst, SE, M.Ip above, it shows that the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Office has a budget or funds in supervision activities but the budget owned is very minimal, because the transportation office supervises not only in the city of Pasir Pengaraian or also other areas in Rokan Hulu, but the transportation office still conducts surveillance at the point of travel vulnerability that operates in.

Based on the results of interviews, observations, and documentation on input indicators, it can be said that the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Office has supervised illegal travel in Pasir Pengaraian City and every supervision activity has a budget or funds but the budget is minimal because the scope of the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Office is very broad, not only focusing on Pasir Pengaraian City but also other areas so as to reduce illegal travel in Rokan Hulu Regency and Pasir Pengaraian City..

b. Proses

According to Mahmudi (2015; 98) process is a measure of activities measured in terms of speed, accuracy, and accuracy of implementation. Signs of the process include supervision and raids and sanctioning those who violate.

1) Surveillance and raid activities

The existence of supervision and raid activities is one way to determine the effectiveness of the role of the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Office in supervising illegal travel in Pasir Pengaraian City, with the aim of knowing whether or not there is illegal travel operating in Pasir Pengaraian City.

Based on the author's interview with Mr. Sandi Brahmadita Nst, SE, M.Ip as the Head of the Transportation Division of the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Office regarding the sub-indicators of supervision and raid activities, he said:

Supervision and raids carried out by the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Office in Pasir Pengaraian City are still said to be not optimal because there are still a large number of travel that are followed when supervision is carried out, here dishub provides warnings, sanctions, and education to travel drivers who violate regulations, Although the transportation office does not have the capacity to say that this and that travel is illegal because this authority is owned by the provincial transportation office, the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Office tries to provide education to the travel driver or driver to take care of the operating permit and give an appeal so that the traveler formalizes his travel so that it is registered in the official transportation data at the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Office. (Head of Transportation Division, Thursday, June 20, 2024).

Based on the results of interviews with Mr. Sandi Brahmadita Nst, SE, M.Ip regarding the sub-indicators of the existence of supervision and raid activities, it can be seen that the rokan hulu district transportation office has carried out supervision in the city of pasir pengaraian but the activities carried out have not

been maximized because there is still a lot of travel that is followed when supervision is carried out. Furthermore, the author also conducted an interview with Mr. Zeldevia Arizona as a Travel Driver. Regarding the sub-indicator of the existence of supervision and raid activities, he said:

As an active travel driver in Pasir Pengaraian City, I have seen several times the actions taken by the Transportation Agency to monitor illegal travel around this area but very rarely. I have witnessed raids carried out by Transportation Agency officers together with the police at several points. These raids are carried out to check the completeness of business permits and the operational conditions of travel vehicles. This action is sometimes carried out suddenly and intensively. (Travel Driver, Saturday, June 22, 2024).

Based on the author's interview with another driver, Mr. Firman Putra Tama. Regarding the sub-indicator of the existence of monitoring and raid activities, he said:

Yes, so far it is true that the transportation agency has carried out supervision and raids, but it is only carried out at certain points and at certain times, it can be said to be rare so that we can still operate in the Pasir Pengaraian city area when officers are not carrying out supervision. (Travel Driver, Saturday, June 22, 2024).

Based on the results of the researcher's interview with the travel driver or transportation driver, it is known that the sub-indicator of the existence of supervision and raid activities, that the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Agency and the police have conducted supervision and raids in Pasir Pengaraian City, but the supervision and raid activities carried out are very rare, and when supervision is carried out, it is only carried out at several points in Pasir Pengaraian City. The researcher also conducted an interview with Mr. Ilham as a Passenger. Regarding the sub-indicator of supervision and raid activities, he said:

Once when I left Pasir Jam 2 when I arrived at Simpang TB around 4 o'clock, there were Transportation Agency officers and police officers securing and raiding travel transportation that did not complete the administration, so the officers issued a ticket on the road, at that time the travel driver I was riding turned out not to have a driver's license. (Travel Passenger, Sunday, June 23, 2024).

The researcher also conducted an interview with another passenger, Mrs. Rahmah Safitri. Regarding the sub-indicator of the existence of surveillance and raid activities, she said:

Never because when I went back to my hometown I chose a schedule to take a travel at night because after returning from campus on Friday afternoon, at night around 7 o'clock I left Pekanbaru for Pasir Pengaraian. (Travel Passenger, Sunday, June 23, 2024).

Based on the results of the researcher's interview with the passenger, it is known that the vehicle ridden by the passenger had been prosecuted by the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Agency because the travel driver did not have a

driver's license and other passengers said that the vehicle ridden had never been prosecuted because the passenger boarded the travel at night. Based on the results of interviews, observations, and documentation of the process indicators, it can be said that the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Agency and the police have not carried out sufficient supervision because there are still many violations. When supervision and raids are carried out, the supervision and raids carried out are only at certain points and hours so that illegal travel can still operate in the Pasir Pengaraian City area.

Regarding the transportation service, supervision and raids must be accompanied by the police in accordance with Article 19 Paragraph 5 of the Republic of Indonesia Government Regulation Number 80 of 2012 concerning the Method of Inspecting Motor Vehicles on the Road and Taking Action Against Traffic and Road Transportation Violations, which states "to assist civil servant investigators (Transportation Service) in the field of traffic and road transportation in inspecting motor vehicles on the road, the head of the Republic of Indonesia National Police according to his level as stated in paragraph (4) must assign officers from the Republic of Indonesia National Police."

2) Imposing sanctions on violators

Sanctions for violators are one form of supervision that aims to provide a deterrent effect for violating transportation so that it can reduce illegal travel in Pasir Pengaraian City. Based on the interview the researcher conducted with Mr. Sandi Brahmadita Nst, SE., M.Ip as Head of Transportation Division of the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Service regarding the sub-indicator of sanctions for violators, he said:

Of course there are,..There are still many travel drivers who are prosecuted when supervision is carried out, of course we give fines, the violations are varied, both those who do not have a permit, or the vehicles operated are not suitable for operation, as well as overloaded with passengers, in this case of course we, the transportation service accompanied by the police, carry out supervision and raids. (Head of Transportation, Thursday, June 20, 2024)

Based on the results of the researcher's interview with Mr. Sandi Brahmadita Nst, SE., M.Ip related to the sub-indicator of imposing sanctions for violators, it is known that when supervision and raids were carried out, many travel transportation vehicles were prosecuted for various violations such as not having a permit, overloaded passengers, and vehicles that were not fit to operate so that the transportation agency imposed sanctions on the violating travel drivers. Based on the researcher's interview with Mr. Zeldevia Arizona as a Travel Driver. Regarding the sub-indicator of imposing sanctions for violators, he said:

Yes, of course there is and I have been prosecuted by the transportation service and police officers, interrogated and then given a warning and released by them and still operating because of economic demands and family needs and this is also one of the risks if you do not take care of the permit but continue to operate. (Travel Driver, Saturday, June 22, 2024)

Furthermore, the researcher also conducted an interview with another driver, Mr. Firman Putra Tama. Regarding the sub-indicator of giving sanctions to violators, he said:

Yes, there is, when the action was taken, all the correspondence was checked and my vehicle was physically checked, coincidentally at that time I was taken because I was found to be overloaded with passengers. (Travel Driver, Saturday, June 22, 2024)

Based on the results of the researcher's interview with the travel driver above regarding the sub-indicator of imposing sanctions for violators, it is known that the travel driver had been prosecuted by the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Agency and the police, of course, he received sanctions in the form of a ticket. The researcher also conducted an interview with Mr. Ilham as a Passenger. Regarding the sub-indicator of imposing sanctions for violators, he said:

In my opinion, it is still not, because there are still many illegal travel agencies operating, I have high hopes for the safety and comfort of using transportation services in Pasir Pengaraian City. A strict monitoring system for illegal travel and consistent law enforcement can provide assurance that every vehicle operating has met the established safety standards. (Travel Passenger, Sunday, June 23, 2024)

Furthermore, the researcher also conducted an interview with another passenger, Mrs. Rahmah Safitri. Regarding the sub-indicator of giving sanctions to violators, she said:

It can be said that not yet, because if the travel driver is aware, they will immediately take care of the legality or route permit. (Travel Passenger, Sunday, June 23, 2024)

Based on the results of the researcher's interview with the above travel passengers regarding the sub-indicator of imposing sanctions on violators, it is known that according to passengers, there is still no awareness for travel drivers when they have been prosecuted by the transportation agency, which has not created a deterrent effect so that they do not repeat it, but passengers hope that the transportation agency will carry out strict supervision so that passengers feel safe and comfortable riding travel in Pasir Pengaraian City.

Based on the results of interviews, observations, and documentation of the process indicators of the sub-indicator of imposing sanctions on violators, it can be said that imposing sanctions on transportation or travel that violates has been carried out by the transportation agency, the sanctions given are in the form of fines, the violations committed are various, but the drivers after being prosecuted continue to operate in the Pasir Pengaraian city area, the hope of passengers, namely travel drivers, can be aware and change to obey the existing rules so that they are safe to operate in Pasir Pengaraian City.

c. Output

According to Mahmudi (2015;99) output is a direct result of a process. This result is seen through a comparison of input and output results, results and percentage of work program achievement, and on output indicators, such as violation markers and monitoring efforts made.

1) Violation Data Collection

Data collection of violations is one of the ways of the Rokan Hulu Transportation Agency in terms of supervision to find out how many levels of violations occur, especially illegal travel operating in Pasir Pengaraian City and to find out how many illegal travels are prosecuted. Based on the author's interview with Mr. Sandi Brahmadita Nst, SE., M.Ip as Head of Transportation Division of the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Agency regarding the sub-indicator of data collection of violations said:

Of course, we will collect data or summarize databases of transportation or vehicles that violate, especially in the official and illegal travel transportation services and if we find that the transportation that violates has an organization or company and has a yellow plate, we do not hesitate to contact the head of the company or transportation organization, but we still appeal to people transportation entrepreneurs in this case, namely travel that does not have a permit, to take care of route permits and take care of administration because the requirements for making it are not difficult. (Head of Transportation, Thursday, June 20, 2024)

Based on the results of the author's interview with Mr. Sandi Brahmadita Nst, SE., M.Ip regarding the sub-indicator of violation data collection, it is known that the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Service has conducted data collection when conducting supervision and raid activities in Pasir Pengaraian City, the data collection carried out is summarized into the database and when the transportation service finds that the travel transportation that violates has an organization or company, the transportation service contacts the transportation company directly, and the transportation service also appeals to travel or transportation that does not yet have a permit to take care of all permits because the licensing requirements from the transportation service are not difficult.

Based on the results of interviews, observations, and documentation of the output indicators of the violation data collection sub-indicators, it can be said that the transportation agency will record travel or transportation that is found to have violated the rules. This effort is made in order to find out which travel or transportation violated the rules so that it can reduce and eliminate violations of public transportation in Pasir Pengaraian City.

2) Achievement of supervision efforts

The achievement of this supervision effort means that there is an effectiveness of the role of the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Agency in supervising illegal travel in Pasir Pengaraian City. Based on the author's interview with Mr. Sandi Brahmadita Nst, M.Si., M.Ip as the Head of Transportation Division of the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Agency regarding the subindicator of achieving supervision efforts, he said:

It can be said that it has not been achieved, but the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Agency has implemented a comprehensive performance evaluation system to monitor and assess the effectiveness of efforts to supervise illegal travel in Pasir Pengaraian City. Among them include several components, namely collecting data with regular reporting. Each supervisory officer is required to report their daily activities, including the number of operations carried out, the number of vehicles inspected, and other findings. Furthermore, conducting monthly evaluations to assess supervision performance, discussing challenges faced, and determining strategies for the following month. And collaborating with related parties, namely holding regular meetings with the police, prosecutors, courts, and Organda to ensure the cooperative relationship is implemented. (Head of Transportation, Thursday, June 20, 2024)

Based on the results of the researcher's interview with Mr. Sandi Brahmadita Nst, SE., M.Ip, regarding the sub-indicator of achieving supervision efforts, it is known that efforts to supervise illegal travel in Pasir Pengaraian City have not been achieved, but the Rokan Hulu Transportation Agency always tries to evaluate the performance of each member, especially from supervision activities so that in the future the implementation of supervision activities carried out can be effective.

d. Outcome

According to Mahmudi (2015;99) outcome is the result achieved from an activity by comparing it with the expected results in the research. The indicators are minimizing violations of official travel and minimizing illegal travel.

1) Minimize violations of official travel

Minimizing official travel violations aims to reduce and avoid potential violations that will occur for people's transportation or travel that has a permit. Based on the interview the researcher conducted with Mr. Sandi Brahmadita Nst, SE., M.Ip as Head of Transportation Division of the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Service regarding the sub-indicator of minimizing official travel violations said:

We always conduct socialization and appeal to official travel or transportation that has a permit to complete all correspondence when operating and obey traffic regulations in the Rokan Hulu and Pasir Pengaraian areas, if found to have committed a violation, we will issue a ticket and revoke its operational permit, we also increase the capacity of supervisory officers, namely by conducting technical training and competency development, this can conduct routine technical training for supervisory officers to improve their skills in supervising and taking action against illegal travel. And develop Standard Operating Procedures (SOP), this is an SOP that is updated operationally to ensure that all supervision and action procedures are carried out consistently and effectively. (Head of Transportation, Thursday, June 20, 2024)

Based on the results of the researcher's interview with Mr. Sandi Brahmadita Nst, SE., M.Ip, related to the sub-indicator of minimizing violations of

official travel, it is known that the transportation agency always appeals and conducts socialization to travel or transportation that is registered to always comply with existing regulations, complete the letters so as to avoid violations that may occur, because if the transportation agency finds violations for official travel transportation, the sanction can be the revocation of the route permit for the transportation that violates. The researcher also conducted an interview with passenger Mrs. Rahmah Safitri. Regarding the sub-indicator of minimizing violations of official travel, she said:

In my opinion, it can be minimized, because in this era of legalization, passengers or the public tend to prefer official transportation, why? Because the first is that there is Jasa Raharja, there is insurance that is paid and security is guaranteed, when there is a disaster or accident on the road, passengers will get insurance, which then makes service complaints easy, that's why legality is needed, not only legality but the permits are really complete from the transportation office. (Travel Passenger, Sunday, June 23, 2024)

Based on the results of the author's interview with the above travel passengers regarding the sub-indicator of minimizing violations of official travel, it is known that according to passengers, the activities carried out by the transportation service can minimize violations of official travel, because currently passengers can also distinguish between illegal travel and official travel, of course official travel has insurance for passengers .

Based on the results of interviews, observations, and documentation of the outcome indicators of the sub-indicators, it can be said that minimizing violations of official travel, it is known that the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Service always appeals and reminds all travel transportation operating in Pasir Pengaraian City to complete their correspondence in order to minimize the occurrence of violations in Pasir Pengaraian City and in other areas.

2) Minimize illegal travel

With the rampant illegal travel operating in Pasir Pengaraian City, it is hoped that the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Agency and related parties can minimize illegal travel in Pasir Pengaraian City

Based on the interview conducted by the researcher with Mr. Sandi Brahmadita Nst, SE., M.Ip as the Head of Transportation Division of the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Service. Regarding the sub-indicator of minimizing illegal travel, he said:

We, the transportation agency, in this case find it very difficult to minimize illegal travel vehicles. The main obstacle in monitoring illegal travel is the changing mode of the drivers. Illegal travel drivers often change their routes to avoid raids and supervision, making them difficult to catch and more often using back roads/cut roads. (Head of Transportation, Thursday, June 20, 2024)

Based on the results of the researcher's interview with Mr. Sandi Brahmadita Nst, SE., M.Ip, related to the sub-indicator of minimizing illegal travel, it is known that the transportation agency finds it difficult to take action against

illegal travel, because when supervision and raids are carried out, transportation drivers or travel drivers change the route taken through back roads or roads that are not raided or supervised. Furthermore, based on the author's interview with Mr. Zeldevia Arizona as a travel driver. Regarding the sub-indicator of minimizing illegal travel, he said:

In my opinion, the surveillance operation activities carried out by the Transportation Agency officers have not been effective because the Transportation Agency carries out routine raids and patrols only at certain points and times. (Travel Driver, Saturday, June 22, 2024)

The researcher also conducted an interview with another driver, Mr. Firman Putra Tama. Regarding the sub-indicator of minimizing illegal travel, he said:

Of course it is difficult to minimize illegal travel because coincidentally other friends and I personally feel that when we want to take care of permits, we are constrained by the administration and requirements and regulations in Indonesia which require the unit brought to be used as public transportation to be a maximum of 4 years old, counting back from the time the permit was processed, so that's why we don't take care of route permits. (Travel Driver, Saturday, June 22, 2024)

Based on the results of the author's interview with travel drivers, related to the sub-indicator of minimizing illegal travel, it is known that the transportation agency only carries out supervision occasionally and irregularly, and related to minimizing illegal travel, travel drivers find it difficult to take care of operating permits because transportation or travel drivers feel that regulations or rules require transportation or vehicles to be a maximum of 4 years old, counting backwards from the time they take care of permits.

The researcher also conducted an interview with Mr. Ilham as a Passenger. Regarding the sub-indicator of minimizing illegal travel, he said:

It's actually very difficult.. because I once used an unofficial travel. At that time I used an unofficial travel because of the circumstances but I arrived safely at my destination. I feel that travel vehicles in Pasir Pengaraian City have made a positive contribution in meeting my transportation needs. With the hope that supervision of illegal travel continues to be improved, I am sure this transportation service can be a safer and more reliable choice for all transportation users in this area if everyone complies with existing regulations. (Travel Passenger, Sunday, June 23, 2024)

Furthermore, the researcher also conducted an interview with another passenger, Mrs. Rahmah Safitri. Regarding the sub-indicator of minimizing illegal travel, she said:

It seems lacking.., because my experience using travel vehicles in Pasir Pengaraian City is generally positive. I often use this service for short and long distance trips because it is practical and efficient. This travel vehicle usually provides flexible schedule options and routes that suit my needs. In addition, in terms of comfort, I

feel that the travel services in Pasir Pengaraian City are quite adequate. so that the trip becomes more comfortable. I am also happy with the choice of additional services such as good AC, as well as friendly service from the drivers. (Travel Passenger, Sunday, June 23, 2024)

Based on the results of the researcher's interview with the above travel passengers related to the sub-indicator of minimizing illegal travel, it is known that it is difficult for the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Agency to minimize illegal travel vehicles in Pasir Pengaraian City because passengers feel that the existence of this travel has a positive impact on passengers with flexible schedules and routes according to what passengers need.

Based on the results of interviews, observations, and documentation of the outcome indicators of the sub-indicators of minimizing illegal travel, it can be said that the difficulties experienced by the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Agency are when they find out that there is a raid and supervision of drivers, they look for other routes to avoid action by the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Agency and the police, and in terms of licensing, drivers assume that the obstacles faced when they want to take care of licensing are that the vehicle unit is a maximum of 4 years old and must not be more, and for passengers with the existence of illegal travel still operating, it is very helpful because of its large contribution to transportation, but in this case, awareness is needed for all parties about the dangers of taking illegal transportation.

2. Inhibiting Factors of the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Agency in Supervising Illegal Travel in Pasir Pengaraian City

The inhibiting factors for the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Agency in supervising illegal travel in Pasir Pengaraian City are as follows:

a. **Indikator** *Input*

To find out the inhibiting factors of the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Agency in supervising illegal travel, the input indicators of which are sub-indicators, namely socialization or counseling, and the budget for supervision activities, the researcher conducted an interview with Mr. Sandi Brahmadita Nst, SE., M.Ip who said:

Not all people or residents are willing to attend socialization or counseling events related to traffic safety education, especially taking official public transportation because they do not have time, and regarding the budget for supervision activities, there are funds or budgets for these activities, but the budget is very minimal because the scope of the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Agency is not only in Pasir Pengaraian City but also several places in Rokan Hulu, this is also one of the inhibiting factors for us in terms of supervision. (Head of Transportation, Thursday, June 20, 2024)

It can be seen that the obstacles of the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Service are input indicators, namely the lack of public willingness to participate in socialization and counseling carried out by the Rokan Hulu Regency

Transportation Service regarding traffic safety related to public transportation, obstacles of the Transportation Service related to small and minimal activity budgets, because the supervision activities carried out are not only in Pasir Pengaraian City, but also other areas in Rokan Hulu Regency.

b. Indikator Proses

In identifying the obstacles that hinder the efforts of the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Agency to monitor illegal travel, the process indicators of which are sub-indicators, namely the existence of monitoring and raid activities, and the imposition of sanctions for violators, the researcher conducted an interview with Mr. Sandi Brahmadita Nst, SE., M.Ip who said:

The Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Agency and the police have conducted raids and supervision in Pasir Pengaraian City, and if they are found to have committed violations, they will definitely be given sanctions, but the imposition of these sanctions does not have a deterrent effect on travel drivers or transportation drivers. (Head of Transportation, Thursday, June 20, 2024)

It can be seen that the obstacles of the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Agency are process indicators, namely that the transportation agency and police have carried out supervision and raids and given sanctions to violators, but the imposition of these sanctions can be said to be light because they do not create a deterrent effect and discourage drivers who violate so that they continue to operate in Pasir Pengaraian City

c. **Indikator** Output

In order to find out the obstacles that prevent the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Agency from supervising illegal travel, the output indicators of which are sub-indicators, namely data collection of violations and the achievement of supervision efforts, the researcher conducted an interview with Mr. Sandi Brahmadita Nst, SE., M.Ip who said:

The inhibiting factor of the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Agency and the police is that every time supervision and raids are carried out, of course, data is collected for those who violate, but for example, today's and tomorrow's violation data are different, this indicates that there are a lot of transportation that commits violations. (Head of Transportation, Thursday, June 20, 2024).

It can be seen that the obstacles of the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Service are output indicators, namely the transportation service and police have data for every raid carried out, but the data for today's raid and the next day's raid are different, this indicates that there are still many violations committed by transportation or travel in Pasir Pengaraian City.

d. **Indikator** *Outcome*

In identifying the obstacles that prevent the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Agency from supervising illegal travel, the outcome indicator, the sub-indicators of which are minimizing violations of official travel and minimizing illegal travel, the researcher conducted an interview with Mr. Firman Putra Tama as a travel driver who said.

Of course, it is difficult to minimize illegal travel because coincidentally, other friends and I personally feel that when we want to take care of permits, we are constrained by the administration and existing requirements and regulations, which require the unit or vehicle brought to be used as public transportation to be a maximum of 4 years old, counting back from the time the permit was processed, so that's why we don't take care of route permits. (Travel Driver, Saturday, June 22, 2024)

Researchers conducted an interview with Mrs. Rahmah Safitri as a travel passenger who said:

Because my experience using travel vehicles in Pasir Pengaraian City is generally positive. I often use this service for short and long distance trips because it is practical and efficient. This travel vehicle usually provides flexible schedule options and routes that suit my needs. In addition, in terms of comfort, I feel that the travel services in Pasir Pengaraian City are quite adequate. so that the trip becomes more comfortable. I am also happy with the choice of additional services such as air conditioning that works well. (Travel passenger, Sunday, June 23, 2024).

It can be seen that the obstacles of the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Agency are outcome indicators, where transportation drivers or travel drivers feel constrained by the regulations that have been set, in this case where one of the requirements cannot be met by the travel driver, namely the physical condition and age of the vehicle which must not exceed 4 years since the route permit process, if this condition does not receive serious attention from the transportation agency, of course travel drivers will be reluctant to apply for operating permits, especially in the Pasir Pengaraian City area, and related to passengers who continue to ride illegal travel, it indicates that the level of public or passenger awareness is still lacking regarding the dangers of riding illegal travel, where when passengers are aware, they will minimize the risk, of course this also needs serious attention from the transportation agency.

CONCLUSION

The conclusion in this study is based on the research findings and discussions discussed in the previous chapters related to the effectiveness of the role of the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Agency in supervising illegal travel in Pasir Pengaraian City. From the results of this study, both observations and interviews with informants, the researcher can conclude as follows: (1) The results of the study indicate that the effectiveness of the Role of the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Agency in supervising illegal travel in Pasir Pengaraian City has 4 indicators, namely input indicators, process indicators, output indicators and outcome indicators, the results of the input indicator, namely the socialization carried out is quite good, but the budget for supervision is not good, the results of the process indicator, namely supervision activities and the imposition of sanctions for violators, are not good because they have not made drivers aware, the results of the output indicator, namely data collection of

violators, are quite good, but supervision efforts have not been achieved and are not good. The results of the outcome indicator, namely minimizing violations of official travel and illegal travel, are not good and have not been said to be effective. (2) The inhibiting factors or obstacles of the Rokan Hulu Regency Transportation Agency in supervising illegal travel in Pasir Pengaraian City can be seen in the Input indicator, namely the lack of public willingness to participate in socialization and counseling, and related to the budget sub-indicator for supervision and raid activities, there is one but it is small and minimal. For the process indicator, the transportation agency and police have carried out raids and supervision and given sanctions to violators. However, these sanctions are only light because they do not provide a deterrent effect or discourage drivers who violate. In the output indicator, violation data is stored by the transportation agency and police every time a raid is carried out. However, this data differs from one raid to the next, indicating that violations continue to occur in Pasir Pengaraian City. And in the outcome indicator, travel drivers feel pressured by the regulations that have been made by the transportation agency and police, such as the physical condition of passengers and the age of vehicles which must not exceed 4 years from the time the route permit is processed. In addition, passengers who continue to ride illegal travel indicate that passengers are not yet sufficiently aware of the dangers of riding illegal travel.

REFERENCES

- Adi Putra, Arikha Saputra, 2023. Hukum Angkutan Umum Ilegal Bagi Penumpang bila Penumpang Bila Terjadi Kecelakaan. Jawa Tengah: Jurnal Imu Hukum.
- Adhari, Y. (2021). TA: Analisis Pendapatan Angkutan Umum Pada Masa Adaptasi Kebiasaan Baru (Doctoral dissertation, Institut Teknologi Nasional).
- Ali, dan Andi Syamsu Alam. 2016. Studi Kebijakan Pemerintah. Bandung: PT. Refika Aditama.
- Alifah, Vanessa, 11775201855 (2021). Analisis Pengawasan Travel Ilegal Antar Kota Dalam Provinsi (Akdp) Oleh Dinas Perhubungan Provinsi Riau Di KotaPekanbaru. FEB UIN Suska.
- Anggraini Dwi Milandry, Esy Kurniasih, Teguh Rama Prasja, 2022. Perlindungan Konsumen Dalam Hal Pelaksanaan Tanggung Jawab Pengusaha Travel Tanpa Izin Operasional. Rokan Hilir: Jurnal Ilmu Hukum.
- Baharuddin, Thahir. 19750502200604 (2019). Pemerintah dan pemerintahan Indonesia Sebuah Bunga Rampai, IPDN.
- Brigette Lantaeda, S., Lengkong, F. D. J., & Ruru, J. M. (2002). Peran Badan Perencanaan Pembangunan Daerah Dalam Penyusunan Rpjmd Kota Tomohon. *Jurnal Administrasi Publik (JAP)*, 04(048), 243.
- Fernando, Ahnad Rio, 2016. *Pengawasan Dinas Perhubungan Kota Pekanbaru* (*Studi Angkutan Travel*). Pekanbaru : Universitas Islam Riau
- Gemilar, A. (2019). Pelaksanaan Peraturan Menteri Perhubungan Republik Indonesia Nomor Pm 118 Tahun 2018 Tentang Penyelenggaraan Angkutan

- Sewa Khusus (Studi Kasus Pada Taksi Online Di Kota Yogyakarta). Dinamika Hukum, 10(3), 15–35.
- Husin Ilyas, Afif Syarif dan. Netty, 2012. Fungsi Pemerintah Dalam Rangka Pelayanan Publik Berdasarkan Peraturan Perundang-undangan Di Indonesia. Jambi : ISSNHayat. 2017. Manajemen Pelayanan Publik. Jakarta: PT. Raja Grafindo Pereda. Kamaludin, Rustian. 1987. Ekonomi Transportasi. Jakarta: Ghalia Indonesia.
- Hariyanto, D. (2023). Upaya Dinas Perhubungan Dalam Menangani Parkir Liar Di Kota Probolinggo. Jurnal Ilmiah Cakrawarti, 6(2).
- Juniar Fajrily S. M. Lihawa, Nur Mohamad Kasim, Sri Nanang Meiske Kamba, 2023. Bentuk Tanggung Jawab Travel Umroh Ilegal Terhadap Konsumen. Gorontalo: SOSTECH.
- Irianto, H., Ratnawati, S., & Tyas, F. S. (2023). Efektivitas Sistem Informasi Manajemen Kepegawaian Dinas Perhubungan Kota Surabaya. Intelektual (E- Journal Administrasi Publik dan Ilmu Komunikasi), 10(1), 89-97.
- Ikhsan, A. M., Soesanto, E., & Soesanto, B. S. A. (2024). Implementasi Standar Transportasi Dalam Pelayanan Layanan Angkutan Umum Di Trans Jakarta Yang Berbasis Kepada Uud1945. *Scientica: Jurnal Ilmiah Sains dan Teknologi*, 2(6), 244-256.
- Jailani, M. S. (2023). Teknik pengumpulan data dan instrumen penelitian ilmiah pendidikan pada pendekatan kualitatif dan kuantitatif. IHSAN: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam, 1(2), 1-9.
- Mutiawati, Cut, dkk, (2019). Kinerja Pelayanan Angkutan Umum Jalan Raya. Seleman, Jawa Tengah: CV Budi Utama.
- Nasharuddin, Amirullah Maulana, 2021. Legalitas Kendaraan Travel Plat Hitam Berdasarkan Undang-Undang Nomor.22 Tahun 2009 tentang Lalu Lintas dan Angkutan Jalan(Studi AA Travel Kota Malang).Malang: Universitas Negeri Maulana Malik Ibrahim Malang
- Pratiwi, D., Nataliawati, R., Dewi, A., Berlyn Haskim, M., Dahlan Lamongan, A., Kunci, K., Pajak Bea Perolehan Hak Atas Tanah dan Bangunan, E., Pajak Bea Perolehan Hak Atas Tanah dan Bangunan, P., & Asli Daerah, P. (2021). Analysis of Effectiveness and Contribution of Tax Revenue of Duties on Land and Building Rights To the Original Income of Lamongan Regency. *Jurnal Media Komunikasi Ilmu Ekonomi*, 38(Desember), 2021–2035.
- Putra, R. A., & Saputra, A. (2023). Hukum Angkutan Umum Ilegal Bagi Penumpang Bila Terjadi Kecelakaan. *Legal Standing: Jurnal Ilmu Hukum,* 7(2), 197-208.
- Purwadi, P. (2017). Pengaruh Pengawasan Langsung dan Tidak Langsung terhadap Efektivitas Kerja Pegawai pada Dinas Pekerjaan Umum dan Pemukiman Prasarana Wilayah Kota Samarinda. AKUNTABEL: Jurnal Ekonomi dan Keuangan, 14(2), 187-194.
- Puspa, A., Zuama, C., Dinda, C. M., Pamungkas, D., Ir, J., & Jebres, S. (2009). Telaah Regulasi Ojek Online di Indonesia dalam Perspektif Filsafat Fenomenologi

- Hukum Review of Online Ojek Regulation in Indonesia from the Perspective of Phenomenological Philosophy of Law. 2021, 25(1), 21–40.
- Rahman, Mulyawan, (2015). Sistem Pemerintah Indonesia. Bandung: UNPAD Press
- Sari, Putri Eka, 2019. Fungsi Pengawasan Dinas Perhubungan Dalam Menertibkan Travel Ilegal di Kota Pekanbaru. Pekanbaru : Universitas IslamRiau
- Setiawan, Anggito. (2018), Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif. Jawa tengah: CVJejak. Safiie, Kencana Inu., 2019. Ilmu Pemerintahan. Bandung: Mandar Maju
- Sugianto, Muhammad Arif Kurniawan, 2020. *Tingkat Keterkaitan Masyarakat Terhadap Transportasi Online, Angkutan Pribadi dan Angkutan Umum* Grafindo Pereda. Kamaludin, Rustian. 1987. Ekonomi Transportasi. Jakarta: Ghalia Indonesia.
- Sugiono, (2019). Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif Kualitatif dan R&D. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Sururama, Rahmawati, (2020). *Pengawasan Pemerintahan*. Bandung :Cendekia press.
- Triansyah, A. (2023). Kewenangan Dinas Perhubungan Provinsi Jawa Barat Dalam Penetapan Tarif Transportasi Angkutan Umum Antar Kota Dalam Provinsi Pasca Kenaikan Bahan Bakar Minyak (Doctoral Dissertation, Fakultas Hukum Universitas Pasundan).
- Yuanggraini, Y. (2015). Efektivitas Pelaksanaan Penertiban Truk Bertonase Berat Di Kota Pekanbaru. *Jom Fisip, Vol. 2, No*(2), 1–11.